

Town of Barnstable
Old King's Highway Historic District Committee
MINUTES
Wednesday, September 09, 2015
6:30pm

To all persons deemed interested or affected by the Town of Barnstable's Old King's Highway Historic District Act under Section 9 of Chapter 470, Acts of 1973 as amended. You are hereby notified that a hearing was held at the West Barnstable Community Building, 2377 Meetinghouse Way, Barnstable on the following application:

Carrie Bearse	Present
George Jessop	Present
Mary Blair Petiet	Absent
Ellen Merritt	Present
Paul Richard	Present
David Munsell, Jr. (Alternate)	Absent

A quorum being met, Chair Bearse called the hearing to order at 6:30pm. The Chair explained the hearing and appeal process and invited the public to address the Committee and view the plans of interest when the application is called.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

Livingston, Henry III & Susan, 74 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, Map 279, Parcel 031-001

Demolish Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage

(Continued from August 12 & 26, 2015)

Represented by Timothy Luff, Archi-Tech Assoc, Inc. & Jack Delaney, Contractor

NOTE: Carrie Bearse recused herself from the discussion and vote and removed herself from the room.

A Motion was duly made by Paul Richard, seconded by Ellen Merritt to appoint George Jessop as Temporary Chair

So Voted Unanimously

Two letters of support were received and Temporary Chair George Jessop read them into the record. One was from Ed & Pat DeGraan of 56 Rendezvous Lane and the other from Marian Ferguson & Dick Hawkins of 110 Salten Point Road. (Exhibits A&B)

George Jessop then opened Public Comment:

Peter Eastman stated that he owns two historic properties and he realizes that when you own something old, you are constantly restoring it. It is tempting to tear it down, but he would replace with something that is architecturally appropriate to the neighborhood. If this Committee allows the demolition, it will open the door to larger and larger houses.

Hearing no further comments, George Jessop closed Public Comment.

Paul Richard inquired if this Committee needs to vote on the demolition before discussing the application for the new dwelling. George Jessop noted that both applications were called at the same time, and determined that they could begin with the rebuild if that was the consensus of the members. Discussion continued regarding the Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new single family dwelling and attached garage as listed below.

Livingston, Henry III & Susan, 74 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, Map 279, Parcel 031-001

Construct New Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage

(Continued from August 12 & 26, 2015)

Represented by Timothy Luff, Archi-Tech Assoc, Inc. & Jack Delaney, Contractor

Mr. Luff asked if the members have taken a look at the existing house and walked the property. All three members noted that they did view the house, but did not walk the property. Mr. Luff stated the house was built in 1955 and he did try to do some homework on the original architect and could not determine if it was John Barnard, Sr. or Jr. George Jessop confirmed that it was John Barnard, Sr. as he has a list of list his work.

Tim Luff reported that this project has been approved by the Conservation Commission and they were very happy with the reconstruction and landscape plans. Conservation was very pleased with the placement of the structure

as there are environmental challenges with the property.

This area has seen much change with new construction and a half dozen houses in the area that have this square footage and more. The new construction meets the criteria of what has been previously approved in the District with white cedar shingles, windows with true divided light, working shutters with racks and returns. The cupola will be custom made.

George Jessop noted that the new construction is quite a bit larger than the existing structure simply because it will be two stories instead of one. He asked about the increase in square footage and Mr. Luff confirmed that the new construction will be 6193 square feet versus 4514 square feet for the existing.

Ellen Merritt wanted to know if the pool, cabana and surrounding area features are included in the square footage. Tim Luff stated that they are not and as this property is two acres, and, according to the zoning regulations, they have plenty of room. He also noted that there have been several re-builds along this road that are larger houses and include outdoor elements such as pools, pool houses and patios. Jack Delaney added that the house next door was re-built in 1989 and was a replica of a historic home in Chatham and involved a very large addition. Ellen Merritt explained that her concern is that the setting in Barnstable is different than that in Chatham. The houses on Salten Point are very large and do have pools and patios. Her argument would be that Rendezvous Lane is closer to Route 6A and the closer these demolition and rebuilds get, the more we will lose.

George Jessop noted that there are a few houses in this area in excess of one story, but most are limited to one story. Even those that are newly built were built with the rake to appear as one story. He can see where they have tried to attain this element in these drawings. Tim Luff stated that the objective was to try not to have a vertical element like a colonial. The history of this property was that the original house was a beautiful, extremely large structure. Jack Delaney confirmed that the original structure offered vaudeville acts. This was torn down and another large house built in 1870. This one was torn down in 1949 and rebuilt as you see it today. Using the map of 1870, they discovered that there were very large homes built on Rendezvous Lane.

George Jessop added that because of this style of house, what sets it apart is the first floor is very close to the ground and the front door is below ground level so it appears the house comes up out of the ground. It is taking the style of the house and fitting it to the ground which he likes. All in all, it is a very nice design. Not mirror image and appears that it was not built all at one time. Tim Luff commented that they did reduce the 3-car garage to a 2-car garage to reduce the mass and scale.

Ellen Merritt noted that the existing garage is located at the back of the lot and asked if it was possible to relocate the doors of the proposed garage to the front. Jack Delaney explained that it would make it very tight and they would not be able to get two cars into the garage. George Jessop suggested making the garage a bit deeper to accommodate this change. Tim Luff stated that a lot has been invested into these plans and he could not speak to this change without conferring with the homeowners.

George Jessop opened Public Comment for the application to re-build

Peter Eastman wished to note for the record that there is a distinct difference between Rendezvous Lane and Salten Point and he does not find this design appropriate to the area.

Hearing no further comment, Chair Jessop closed Public Comment

George Jessop surmised that since there was a house much larger than this one originally on the property, as well as large homes in the area, he does not feel it is inappropriate. Ellen Merritt, however, commented that the character of the homes from 6A down Rendezvous are distinctly different than those on Salten Point.

Ellen Merritt discussed the landscaping plan and the intent to remove 2-3 trees that line Rendezvous Lane. She believes that one, if not all three could be saved with proper pruning. If they do take them out, she recommends replacement with indigenous species. Jack Delaney remarked that the plan indicates that they will be putting in trees with a 6-8' caliper and added that a lot of time and effort has been put into this landscaping plan. Ellen Merritt also noted that an existing maple in the middle of the lot that is slated to be removed could be replanted along Rendezvous Lane. Tim Luff believed that he could make the replacement of these trees happen and added that they are also looking to remove the foreign trees and plant more indigenous species. Ellen Merritt added that it would also not be a terrible thing if the driveway line was not so straight to soften the effect.

VOTE REGARDING CERTIFICATE OF DEMOLITION AT 74 RENDEZVOUS LANE

Motion duly made by Paul Richard, seconded by Ellen Merritt to Approve the Certificate of Demolition (Exhibit C) for Henry & Susan Livingston III at 74 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

VOTE REGARDING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AT 74 RENDEZVOUS LANE

Motion duly made by Ellen Merritt, seconded by Paul Richard to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (Exhibit D) for Henry & Susan Livingston III at 74 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, with the exception of the cabana and the revision of the landscape changes along the street that replace at least 2, if not 3 maples that are to be removed with red maples and be of a caliper of 5-6'.

So Voted Unanimously

APPLICATIONS

NOTE: Carrie Bearse returns as Chair for the remainder of the meeting

Reuman, Steven & Deborah, 185 Stoney Point Road, Barnstable, Map 336, Parcel 027

Construct 1 ½ Story Attached Garage

Represented by Steven & Deborah Reuman

Ms. Reuman stated that they would like to construct a 1 ½ story garage. They have tried to make it consistent with the existing house as far as materials, size and massing. All materials will match the existing house, siding, roof color, etc. One other project is the deck on the rear of the house. They would like to remove the pickets and replace with cables. Paul Richard noted that this is on the rear elevation and will not be visible. George Jessop asked if the style of the door on the west elevation of the garage is to represent a carriage style door. Carrie Bearse feels the garage is very appropriate given the scale of the house.

Motion duly made by Paul Richard, seconded by Ellen Merritt to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (Exhibit E) for Steven & Deborah Reuman at 185 Stoney Point Road, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

George, Eric & Priscilla, 2084 Main Street, Barnstable, Map 217, Parcel 026

Construct 2nd Floor to Existing Garage, Rear Dormer, New Front Entry, Windows & Doors

A continuance to September 23, 2015 was requested by contractor.

Motion duly made by Paul Richard, seconded by Ellen Merritt to Continue the Certificate of Appropriateness for Eric & Priscilla George at 2084 Main Street, Barnstable to September 23, 2015 at 6:30pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Cutler, Richard & Dulin, Kimberly, 104 Deer Jump Hill, West Barnstable, Map 132, Parcel 041

Construct Covered Porch, New Garage Doors, Alteration of Windows

Represented by Ken Murphy, Contractor

Mr. Murphy reviewed the project and noted that the homeowner wishes to update the property with a covered porch on the front elevation. Also replace the garage doors and replace a very large picture window with three double hung windows with tru divided light. Carrie Bearse asked if they were keeping the same colors as the house for the covered porch and Mr. Murphy confirmed that the posts on the porch will be the same color as the clapboard.

Motion duly made by Ellen Merritt, seconded by Paul Richard to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (exhibit F) for Richard Cutler & Kimberly Dulin at 104 Deer Jump Hill, West Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

CERTIFICATE OF EXEMPTIONS

Titus, Steven, 516 Marstons Lane, Barnstable, Map 348, Parcel 028

10' X 14' Shed

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Paul Richard to Approve the Certificate of Exemption (Exhibit G) for Steven Titus at 516 Marstons Lane, Barnstable as Submitted. NOTE: Staff confirmed that the shed will be located behind the dwelling.

So Voted Unanimously

MINOR MODIFICATION

Langeland, Douglas & Dianne, 25 Tisquantum Road, Barnstable, Map 352, Parcel 015

Window Alteration

Motion duly made by Ellen Merritt, seconded by Paul Richard to Approve the Minor Modification (Exhibit H) for Douglas & Dianne Langeland at 25 Tisquantum Road, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Minutes of August 12, 2015

Minutes were continued to the September 23, 2015 hearing at 6:30pm.

Having no further business before this Committee, a motion was made by Ellen Merritt, seconded by Paul Richard to Adjourn the Meeting at 7:56pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Respectfully submitted,
Marylou Fair
Recording Secretary

Exhibit A – Letter of Support, Ed & Pat DeGrann – File 279/031-001 dtd 08.12.2015

Exhibit B – Letter of Support, Ferguson/Hawkins – File 279/031-001 dtd 08.12.2015

Exhibit C – Certificate of Demolition – File 279/031-001 dtd 08.12.2015

Exhibit D - Certificate of Appropriateness – File 279/031-001 dtd 08.12.2015

Exhibit E– Certificate of Appropriateness – File 336/027 dtd 09.09.2015

Exhibit F– Certificate of Appropriateness – File 132/041 dtd 09.09.2015

Exhibit G– Certificate of Exemption – 2015 Exemption File dtd 09.09.2015

Exhibit H – Minor Modification – 2015 Minor Modification File dtd 09.09.2015