

APPROVED MINUTES

Barnstable Historical Commission
Barnstable Town Hall, 367 Main Street, Hyannis
Selectmen's Conference Room
April 17, 2018

2018 MAY 22 PM 2:20

BARNSTABLE TOWN CLERK

Laurie Young, Chair	Present
Nancy Clark, Vice Chair	Present
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
Nancy Shoemaker	Present
George Jessop, AIA	Absent
Elizabeth Mumford	Absent
Cheryl Powell	Present
Jessica Rapp Grasseti, Town Council Liaison	Present

Chair Laurie Young called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

APPLICATIONS

Cederholm, Eric, & Mycock, Sara, 38 High Street, Cotuit, Map 035, Parcel 047, built 1885, Inventoried (Exhibit A)
Remove L-shaped porch at front right side; remove gable roof, shed dormer, and chimney at right rear; remove 5'X12' one-story ell, and steps at rear; remove bulkhead and flat roof at rear; remove window, siding, and trim. Add mansard roof to match existing, new windows, siding and roofing. Construct new L-shaped porch at front, new master bedroom and garage below at side/rear; new side deck.

Represented by: Tim Luff, Archi-Tech Associates; Gary Souza of Rogers & Marney

Public comment: Laurie Hadley, 55 High Street; Fran Parks

Luff described plans to restore the structure by demolishing the existing front elevation, removing the porch and increasing the interior square footage. He said the gable on the rear elevation would be demolished and replaced with a new mansard roof, and he proposed an addition to the rear elevation, along with all new divided-light windows, new sills, new gutters, new red cedar roofing (rather than the asphalt indicated on the application) and white cedar-shingle siding. Luff also noted removal of the right chimney on the front elevation, adding that the design will clearly define the original home from the new construction.

Laurie Hadley said she is aware of some of the history of the house and feels that the restoration work will be an improvement.

Fran Parks of Cotuit agreed that it will be an asset to the Village of Cotuit and High Street.

Nancy Clark asked Mr. Luff if he considered putting a pseudo chimney in the kitchen area, as she would like to see the same chimney from the roofline up

Chair Young asked Commissioners for feedback on the chimney, and Nancy Clark preferred to see the chimney remain, while Nancy Shoemaker recommended including a strong suggestion to install a second chimney.

MOTION 1:

Nancy Shoemaker moved, seconded by Nancy Clark, that, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 38 High Street, Cotuit, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

Vote: NAY, unanimous

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Nancy Shoemaker moved, seconded by Nancy Clark, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 38 High Street, Cotuit, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town - with the strong suggestion for the addition of a false chimney from roofline up.

An AYE vote determines that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental – no demolition delay imposed

Vote: AYE, unanimous

Prchlik, R. Andrew, 1081 A Main Street, Cotuit, Map 314, Parcel 014, built c. 1860, Inventoried, Contributing Building in a National Register Historic District (Exhibit B)

Remove west-elevation kitchen and single-car garage, increase first-floor living area to include master bedroom, two-car garage, kitchen and breezeway

Represented by: Richard Prchlik, homeowner; Gary Ellis, Architect

Public comment: Jessica Rapp Grasseti, Cotuit resident and Barnstable Town Councilor.

Prchlik handed out a revised plan indicating that the only change would be to increase the square footage of the master bedroom from 12'X12' to 14'X14'. He pointed out the sections he would like to demolish, saying the main structure would be largely untouched. Mr. Ellis said he would like to construct a new connector and build a new garage which would mimic the features of the house.

Nancy Shoemaker asked about the difference in ridgeline, and Mr. Ellis replied that it is 4 feet and that he wants the roof pitch to match the house.

Nancy Clark asked about the style of the door on the plans, and the homeowner and Mr. Ellis replied that it is the existing door that is on the house now. Mr. Prchlik said a suggestion on what would be appropriate would be welcome, but Chair Young said that the door is not within BHC purview.

Nancy Clark noted that the existing chimney is missing in the plans, and Mr. Prchlik replied that he would construct a false chimney, while Mr. Ellis assured that keeping the chimney was always intended.

Jessica Rapp Grasseti noted that the house is prominent but has been neglected for many years, and she said she appreciates the care being put into this project.

MOTION 1: Referral to the Cape Cod Commission¹

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 1081 A Main Street, Cotuit:

- The property is outside a local historic district;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District

¹ Initial vote required to determine the applicability of Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Threshold pursuant to Cape Cod Commission Act Section 12 (c) (1) and CCC Enabling Regulations Governing the Review of Developments of Regional Impacts Chapter A, Section 2(a) (i)(a)

- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

➤ **VOTE: Nay, unanimous**

MOTION 2: Partial Demolition of Building

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that the Barnstable Historical Commission find, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and record file for the partial demolition proposed at **1081 A Main Street, Cotuit**, that this Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

➤ **VOTE: Nay, unanimous**

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at **1081 A Main Street, Cotuit**, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town. An AYE vote determines that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental – no demolition delay imposed

➤ **VOTE Aye, unanimous**

Newberg Trust, Jennifer L., 1187 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, Map 206, Parcel 050, built c.1920, Inventoried and considered individually eligible for National Register listing (Exhibit C) Main house: East elevation - remove door, infill addition, new roof and window; South elevation (front of house) - new dormer and 3 windows; West elevation - new doors, windows, canopy, outdoor shower, terrace and railings, bulkhead; North elevation - new doors, windows, canopy, gable infill, decking, stairs and railings. **Studio** – maintenance of roof, stucco, windows, door and trim, as needed. **Boathouse** – maintenance of roof, stucco, windows, door, and trim, as needed. **Garage** – full demolition

Represented by: Treff LaFleche, LDA Architecture & Interiors; Jennifer Newberg, homeowner

Mr. LaFleche reviewed the background of the house, the proposed project and the existing photographs, and Jennifer Newberg added that she thought that the studio was built to replace space lost in the main structure.

Mr. LaFleche pointed out change in the floor plan over time, noting several replacements to the door and window schedule and the planned extension of the deck along with new windows upstairs and some roof changes, a new gable dormer and new window pattern.

Chair Young confirmed that the plan would mimic the current gable but enlarge it, with new windows and doors planned, along with a canopy to protect them.

Nancy Clark asked about the fenestration on the north side, feeling that the whole side is nothing but glass that seems excessive. She suggested reducing the French casement windows on the second floor beside the chimney from 6'6" or making the balcony inaccessible.

Nancy Shoemaker felt that the chimney needs more space, adding that the stucco walls are part of the home's uniqueness.

Chair Young asked Commissioners if a motion should require a change to the second-floor windows as a condition or if it should be a strong suggestion, and Nancy Clark felt the window change alongside the chimney should be a requirement of the decision.

Cheryl Powell felt that the existing windows do look very tiny and asked if removing the copper canopy could be an option to look less crowded, and Chair Young and Nancy Clark felt removing the canopy could work.

Still, Nancy Clark said that she wanted to see more of the stucco wall between the chimney and the windows, suggesting continuing review of this application with a new plan.

Mr. LaFleche noted that this is the only gable without the benefit of the high ceilings, but Nancy Shoemaker repeated her preference for more wall visible alongside the chimney.

Chair Young agreed that the review should be continued until next month to address the windows.

Marilyn Fifield suggested asking Sarah Korjeff at the Cape Cod Commission to comment, but the Chair objected.

Mr. LaFleche noted that much of the studio and boathouse work is maintenance, replacing things in kind, saying that the boathouse is flooding, and they would like to stabilize and repair it for now.

Mr. LaFleche then proposed demolishing both single-car garages, changing the grading and constructing a single two-car garage, and Chair Young called for a motion on the garages.

FULL DEMOLITION OF GARAGE

MOTION 1:

Nancy Clark moved, seconded by Laurie Young, that after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building (garage) at 1187 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, is a Preferably Preserved Significant Building.

➤ **VOTE:** Nay, unanimous

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Nancy Clark moved, seconded by Laurie Young, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the full demolition of the garage located at 1187 Craigville Beach Road, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

An AYE vote determines that the full demolition IS NOT detrimental - no demolition delay imposed

➤ **VOTE:** Aye, unanimous

Chair Young noted that the remaining items will be reviewed at the next hearing.

Jessica Rapp Grasseti said she recalls this property as the Crayola property, formerly owned by [Edwin] Binney, the Crayola creator.

OTHER

Chair Young proposed that the Commission hold a workshop to discuss priorities, buildings that may be endangered, and the Demolition Delay Ordinance, and she asked that the historic preservation award discussion be put on the May agenda.

Nancy Shoemaker announced two upcoming local events.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Nancy Clark moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, to approve the March 20, 2018, minutes (Exhibit D) as edited.

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

Next meeting dates: May 15, 2018
June 19, 2018

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Cheryl Powell and seconded by Nancy Shoemaker to adjourn the meeting at 5:20pm.

Respectfully Submitted,
Erin K. Logan, Recording Secretary
and Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifiield

Exhibit A	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 035/047/000
Exhibit B	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 314/014/000
Exhibit C	Notice of Intent to Demolish	File 206/050/000
Exhibit D	Meeting Minutes	March 20, 2018